

*Final -- For ASEAN NTOs and ASEAN  
Tourism Ministers Meetings at ATF 2015*



# **ASEAN CLEAN TOURIST CITY STANDARD**

**PREPARED BY  
MINISTRY OF TOURISM OF CAMBODIA**

# INDEX

1. Foreword.....	4
2. Introduction.....	5
3. Scope.....	6
4. Terms and Definitions.....	7
4.1. Cleanliness.....	7
4.2. Congestion Charge Zone.....	7
4.3. Environmentally-Friendly Vehicle.....	7
4.4. Environmental Regulation.....	7
4.5. Green Spaces.....	7
4.6. Health Centres.....	7
4.7. Illegal Activities.....	7
4.8. Norm.....	8
4.9. Planned Tourist itineraries.....	8
4.10. Pollution (water, air, and noise).....	8
4.11. Public Area.....	8
4.12. Raising Awareness.....	8
4.13. Recycling.....	8
4.14. Renewable Energy.....	8
4.15. Risk Management.....	9
4.16. Tourist City.....	9
4.17. Tourism Infrastructure.....	9
4.18. Tourist Police.....	9
4.19. Urban Planning.....	9
4.20. Waste Management.....	9
5. ASEAN Clean Tourist City Standard—INDICATORS.....	10
5.1. Environmental Management Indicators.....	10
5.1.1. Urban planning.....	10
5.1.2. Environmental regulations.....	10
5.1.3. Pollution (water, air and noise).....	11
5.1.4. Environmentally friendly transport.....	11
5.1.5. Sustainable use of energy.....	11
5.2. Cleanliness Indicators.....	11
5.2.1. Cleanliness of public area.....	12
5.2.2. Cleanliness of public toilets.....	12
5.2.3. Cleanliness of tourist sites (museums, temples, parks, beaches etc....).....	12
5.2.4. Cleanliness along the main roads.....	12
5.3. Waste Management Indicators.....	12

5.3.1.	Liquid waste collection .....	13
5.3.2.	Solid waste collection .....	13
5.3.3.	Liquid waste storage and treatment .....	13
5.3.4.	Solid waste storage and treatment.....	13
5.3.5.	Recycling .....	13
5.4.	Awareness-building about Environmental Protection and Cleanliness Indicators .....	14
5.4.1.	Raising awareness of local people about environmental protection and cleanliness .....	14
5.4.2.	Raising awareness of tourism service providers about environmental protection and cleanliness .	14
5.4.3.	Raising awareness of tourists about environmental protection and cleanliness .....	15
5.5.	Green Spaces Indicators .....	15
5.5.1.	Quantity of green space in the city.....	15
5.5.2.	Green space maintenance and management.....	15
5.6.	Health Safety and Urban Safety and Security Indicators.....	15
5.6.1.	Health safety .....	16
5.6.2.	Safety and security in the city .....	16
5.6.3.	Crime prevention and enforcement of rules (child prostitution, drugs etc.).....	16
5.6.4.	Risk management strategy .....	16
5.7.	Tourism Infrastructure and Facilities Indicators .....	17
5.7.1.	Planning for tourism .....	17
5.7.2.	Information centres, signage and tourist maps.....	17
5.7.3.	Location of shopping centres and retail outlets.....	17
5.7.4.	Leisure areas (tourist areas, public parks, sports and recreation...)	18
5.7.5.	Level of tourist satisfaction.....	18
6.	ASEAN Clean Tourist City Standard—CRITERIA.....	18
6.1.	Table of assessment on 5 indicators of environmental management .....	18
6.2.	Table of assessment on 4 indicators of cleanliness .....	20
6.3.	Table of assessment on 5 indicators of waste management .....	22
6.4.	Table of assessment on 3 indicators of Awareness-building about Environmental Protection and Cleanliness Indicators .....	23
6.5.	Table of assessment on 2 indicators of green spaces .....	25
6.6.	Table of assessment on 4 indicators of health safety and urban safety and security.....	25
6.7.	Table of assessment on 5 indicators of tourism infrastructure and facilities indicators.....	27
7.	ASEAN Clean Tourist City Standard—LABEL .....	28
7.1.	Label.....	28
7.2.	Awards .....	29
7.3.	Certification Process.....	29

## **1. Foreword**

The purpose of the ASEAN Clean Tourist City Standard (ACTCS) is to provide ASEAN member countries with a tool that will improve the quality of tourism in their cities, increase their marketing competitiveness but also improve the situation of local residents and their livelihood by alleviating poverty. It is also designed to protect the environment thus responding to the impacts of climate change and contributing to the sustainable development of ASEAN cities. It is vital to note that the ASEAN Tourism Strategic Plan 2011-2015 (ATSP) has indicated the enhancement of the ability of ASEAN tourism to address the climate change issue as one of the priority actions in order to accomplish its strategic directions aimed at increasing the quality of services and facilities in the region.

The standard is based on a series of indicators that will evaluate how sustainable ASEAN cities currently are, the quality of the tourism they offer and identify areas that can be improved. It will provide ASEAN member countries with benchmarks to aim for and ultimately lead to greater tourist satisfaction, greater numbers of visitors and better conditions for the local population.

## 2. Introduction

Tourism in Southeast Asia has developed rapidly as the region is becoming one of the prime destinations on the world tourism map. Tourism is considered to be one of the main sectors for national and regional economic development.

In any discussion of economic development, growth is not an end in itself...the fundamental objective should not be growth but rather broad progress in living standards. After all, growth is an imperfect proxy for the pace and breadth of progress in living standards. But while it may not be sufficient for economic success, it certainly is necessary. In all societies, socioeconomic progress is simply not possible without rising employment, income and wealth. Thus, both the quantity and quality of growth matter. The ultimate objective must be to generate **Big** growth—i.e. strong growth that is also **Balanced** in the sense of being resilient and stable rather than exacerbating inequality, and of course **Green** in the sense of ensuring environmentally sustainable development. Green growth is therefore best understood as a new paradigm to create a new model that produces faster but also wider, more resilient and more environmentally sustainable economic progress. Tourism can play a key role in achieving the quantitative and qualitative aspects of growth.

While cities are well developed across the region, some are only just emerging as tourism destinations. This is the ideal opportunity to encourage cities to develop as they are gateways to the country first welcoming tourists. It is crucial for national and regional tourism development to maintain and enhance the good image and reputation of cities—the ‘face’ of the country—where cultural, natural and man-made attractions exist.

It is strategically important for cities to strive to develop beautiful areas, improve their environment and sanitation, enhance urban spaces and promote the attractions they have to offer. Certainly, the tourist hospitality and welcome in urban areas are very important because many tourist attractions are located in and adjacent to the cities. The local authorities must seriously consider the environmental aspects and living standards in their cities if they are to provide hospitality and to fulfill tourist needs. Thus introducing and establishing the ASEAN Clean Tourist City Standard is necessary, providing ASEAN member states with common benchmarks to aim for in order to achieve greater tourist satisfaction, greater numbers of visitors and better conditions for the local population.

### 3. Scope

The standard focuses on tourist cities where there is flow of visitors and where cultural, natural and/or man-made attractions exist.

The indicators evaluated in the ACTCS are based on the following:

- Environmental Management
- Cleanliness
- Waste Management
- Awareness-building about Environmental Protection and Cleanliness
- Green Spaces
- Health Safety and Urban Safety and Security
- Tourism Infrastructure and Facilities

ASEAN comprises 10 countries with different levels of tourism development, different volumes and types of visitors, different economic, environmental and social impacts from tourism and different political systems and organisation with distinct policies, rules and regulations. Therefore for ACTCS to be successful and relevant to each country the indicators selected for the regional standard must be:

- generically applicable to all countries
- agreed by the majority of the member states
- flexible
- easy to measure and to monitor

Because of its flexible nature, the regional standard would be revised every 3 years if needed.

## **4. Terms and Definitions**

For the purposes of this ASEAN Clean Tourist City Standard, the following terms & definitions apply.

### **4.1. Cleanliness**

Refers to clean and sanitary environment at tourist sites, hotels, restaurants, public places ...etc., including the quality of air, drinking water, and the liquid and solid waste collection and management system.

### **4.2. Congestion Charge Zone**

Refers to the zone where there is excessive traffic or people, making movement slow or difficult. Vehicles accessing the area need to pay charges.

### **4.3. Environmentally-Friendly Vehicle**

Refers to a vehicle that has less harmful impacts on the environment than other comparable engine vehicles running on gasoline or diesel, or one that uses alternative fuels. This kind of vehicle is specifically designed to minimize harm to the natural environment.

### **4.4. Environmental Regulation**

Refers to the rules and regulations concerning controlling impacts on the environment and environmental protection such as air pollution, water pollution, noise pollution, waste control and collection...etc.

### **4.5. Green Spaces**

Refer to locations in urban areas accessible to the public, decorated with flowers, trees, or grass...

### **4.6. Health centres**

Refer to places offering health services. Normally, a health centre refers to a place that houses a medical practice and offers healthcare services.

### **4.7. Illegal Activities**

Refer to activities that are against the law, such as crime, drug trafficking, damage of environmental and cultural assets, etc.

#### **4.8. Norm**

Refers to standard pattern of behaviour that is considered normal and needs to be enforced in a society. More precisely, it refers to enforceable rules by law.

#### **4.9. Planned Tourist itineraries**

Refers to plans that are set up by the local authorities, or by tour operators, showing the location of tourist attractions and sites.

#### **4.10. Pollution (water, air, and noise)**

Refers to all activities of local people, tourists, businesses, etc... that do not meet the national standard (including water quality, air quality, and noise levels).

#### **4.11. Public Area**

Refers to public place where local people and tourists congregate (including administrative buildings to serve the public and equipment in public areas such as benches, public transportation, etc...).

#### **4.12. Raising Awareness**

Refers to activities that are comprised of three main components: awareness raising objectives, goals to be implemented, and support documents that are used to provide information. The awareness-building about environmental protection and cleanliness refers to sensitising local people, tourists and relevant stakeholders about the benefits of cleanliness, hygiene, sanitation, and healthy environment.

#### **4.13. Recycling**

Refers to the process of recycling used materials (waste) into new products to prevent waste of potentially useful materials, reducing energy usage, reducing air pollution (from incineration) and water pollution (from landfilling) by decreasing the need for conventional waste disposal, and lowering greenhouse gas emissions.

#### **4.14. Renewable Energy**

Refers to any form of energy obtained from naturally generated energy sources such as the sun, wind, waves or another natural renewable source, in contrast to energy generated from fuels.



**4.15. Risk Management**

Refers to an authority-made mechanism and measures for preventing and managing unexpected risks and disasters.

**4.16. Tourist City**

Refers to cities where there is flow of visitors and where there are cultural, natural and/or man-made attractions.

**4.17. Tourism Infrastructure**

Refers to the services and facilities in place that facilitate and improve travel and tourism in the city, including all supporting infrastructures such as information centres, signage, etc.

**4.18. Tourist Police**

Refers to the especially trained authority responsible for dealing with problems involving tourists in the city.

**4.19. Urban Planning**

Refers to the plans formulated by the urban authorities to ensure sustainable urban development such as land use planning, zoning, environmental planning and transport planning.

**4.20. Waste Management**

Refers to measures taken by the urban authorities to collect, categorise, and store liquid and solid waste in an efficient and proper way.

## **5. ASEAN Clean Tourist City Standard—INDICATORS**

### **5.1.Environmental Management Indicators**

The environmental management refers to a bundle of methodologies taking a consideration of the impact on environment which can be derived from the development activities of the country, cities or is to arrange for any development project.

The evaluation of the impact on the environment of each activity has been made at different levels and in diverse ways. At the same time, a wide variety of activities we can implement to respond to the issues are as follows: Awareness raising, restriction or other prohibitions and urban development plan, etc.

This indicator is an undeniably important element that we have seen in almost all policies relating to the improvement and enhancement of living standards of the general public. It is certain that we can notice that the basic indicator gathered all of the components—indicating the measurement of current situation of surrounding environment at the living atmosphere by focusing on the main parts of public health's component such as: air quality, generally using water quality, pure drinking water quality, etc. Thus, the ACTCS is aimed at promoting and encouraging the cities to announce and stun the people within the boundaries of their competence as well as the visitors to their cities in order to be aware of environmental situation whereby they are living and visiting.

Furthermore, certain detailed indicators of this indicator have the objective of encouraging all the candidacy cities to start undertaking the preventive measure against any activity which has an adverse effect on the living standards and pushing for the implementation of their urban development plan to be sure about the positive and negative impacts which might be caused by the cities' development activities. The indicator also wishes to raise awareness of the cities about the use of renewable energy.

#### **5.1.1. Urban planning**

This measures whether land use planning, zoning, environmental planning and transportation planning are implemented by the city authorities to ensure the controlled sustainable growth of the city.

#### **5.1.2. Environmental regulations**

The indicator measures whether environmental regulations controlling the operation of tourism businesses exist and whether they are enforced by local authority's sanctions (i.e. for flaunting planning regulation, disregarding waste treatment rules etc....).

### **5.1.3. Pollution (water, air and noise)**

This assesses the level water pollution and whether it is within acceptable norms set out by official regulations. It may refer to rivers (such as Siem Reap or Phnom Penh in Cambodia), seawater along the coastal areas (such as Kompongsohm and Kep in Cambodia) as well as drinking water.

It also assesses air quality in the city and the measures put in place to improve it (i.e. traffic jam reduction initiatives, use of fuel...), the level of noise pollution and whether rules are in place and enforced to keep noise within acceptable norms.

### **5.1.4. Environmentally friendly transport**

This looks at the type transport used in the city (both public and private) and their environmental impact. The use of environmentally-friendly vehicles is encouraged (buses with pollution control mechanisms, electric cars, as well as congestion charge zones...).

### **5.1.5. Sustainable use of energy**

This refers to energy saving and efficiency devices used in tourist businesses (eco light bulbs, on-off switches, the use of key cards, etc...), the use of renewable energy (solar, wind, etc...), and awareness and commitment of tourism firms to energy saving and efficiency.

## **5.2. Cleanliness Indicators**

The public gathering place is a place where many people can make mutual interrelationship. The cleanliness along the public is reliant on individual behaviour and the attention to take care of that place. Besides, the cleanliness along the public gathering places is an important factor affecting the common welfare of all people. In fact, the cleanliness along the public gathering places significantly contributes to improve their living standards and the urban beauty, which is an unavoidable requirement for tourists.

In this indicator, we take into consideration the cleanliness along the public gathering places such as the public buildings, information centres, green areas, commercial centres, resorts and parks, the main roads, and the public toilets, etc.

It will focus on the reality of common views along the public gathering places of the cities and measures the limitation of the attention to the municipal authority's cleanliness. In general, the

urban visitors as well as the general public are attracted with the appearances of their visiting places. And this is also the condition to enhance each urban prestige.

#### **5.2.1. Cleanliness of public area**

This is an important indicator to convey a positive message to tourists as well as to local people and the private sector. The cleanliness of all public areas and buildings, green areas, markets, stations, information centres... should be assessed by the local authorities and sanctions put in place to enforce the rules. The extent of appropriate equipment such as the number of dustbins in public areas should be evaluated and the frequency of maintenance should also be referred to.

#### **5.2.2. Cleanliness of public toilets**

This indicator refers to the number of public toilets at tourist sites in the city, the frequency and quality of their maintenance. This may link to the **ASEAN Public Toilet Standard**.

#### **5.2.3. Cleanliness of tourist sites (museums, temples, parks, beaches etc....)**

This evaluates whether there are enough rubbish bins at tourist sites, the frequency of the collection and disposal of garbage and the general cleanliness and maintenance of the area surrounding the sites. A reference to sanctions for not abiding by the rules should be made.

#### **5.2.4. Cleanliness along the main roads**

This assesses the conditions along the main roads within the city as well as from one city to another, whether they are regularly cleaned and if the appropriate equipment is available (i.e. rubbish bins at regular interval...).

### **5.3. Waste Management Indicators**

Waste management is referred to waste collection and storage. Waste is a consequence of the people's activities fulfilling their daily needs. Waste management in this context has the main objective of contributing to the reduction of negative impact on people's health, on the environment and on the overall urban aesthetics.

It is a fact that since the mid 20th century, the quantity of the waste around the world has increased remarkably (in conjunction with industrial development growth). The negative impact of industrial waste is a global. Even though the waste management and treatment systems at

both global and national levels have faced various challenges of implementation, a simple and easily applied system must be implemented by the cities.

The Standard requires cities to implement an efficient waste management plan including solid and liquid waste collection and treatment as well as awareness campaigns relating to this issue.

#### **5.3.1. Liquid waste collection**

This indicator assesses the public organisation in place to collect liquid waste and measures the percentage of the population linked to the network that disposes of liquid waste. In areas where a network does not exist, it assesses how liquid waste is collected and how often.

#### **5.3.2. Solid waste collection**

This indicator assesses the public organisation in place to collect solid waste and measures the percentage of the population linked to the network that disposes of solid waste (existence of a disposal area near where the population lives). In areas where a network does not exist, it assesses how solid waste is collected and how often.

#### **5.3.3. Liquid waste storage and treatment**

This assesses both the availability of storage areas for liquid waste that can be used by the general population through collection by the authorities and the availability of private storage equipment at tourist facilities (i.e. septic tanks) as well as the equipment available to treat the waste products (i.e. water treatment plants).

#### **5.3.4. Solid waste storage and treatment**

This assesses the availability of storage areas for solid waste that can be used by the general population and tourist firms through collection by the authorities (i.e. landfills). The methods used to treat solid waste are also evaluated (i.e. waste treatment and recycling plants, burning, burying...).

#### **5.3.5. Recycling**

This evaluates whether the local authority encourages recycling and whether there is a system in place to collect and recycle material. It also refers to the awareness of the importance of recycling among the local population and especially tourism service providers (hotels, restaurants, tour operators, etc....).

## **5.4.Awareness-building about Environmental Protection and Cleanliness Indicators**

The awareness raising refers to activities that are comprised of three main components: awareness raising objectives, goals to be implemented, and support documents that are used to provide information. The awareness-building about environmental protection and cleanliness refers to sensitising local people, tourists and relevant stakeholders about the benefits of cleanliness, hygiene, sanitation, and healthy environment.

The awareness raising can be considered as a form of knowledge or general knowledge transformation/provision (In general, it is a consequence from repeated activities). That's why, the objectives of awareness-building is to spread information about the damages which are the challenges of daily wrong implementation and to disseminate/explain the right attitude and implementation—possibly contributing to improve the living standards. The Clean Tourist City Standard has a special interest to the reminder of the attention of local people, tourism service providers, and tourists about environment and cleanliness.

The awareness raising is a main mechanism for encouraging the implementation of the Clean Tourist City Standard. The mechanism is considered as key activity which should be initiated by the cities to remind relevant stakeholders to understand and start contributing to gradually implement the standard. It can be made in different forms. We do not require any special activity by providing the possibility for cities deciding to choose the methods deserving their situation. Aside from, the assessment should be focused on the efficiency, regularity of activities which are set forth. The awareness raising can be implemented in collaboration with other relevant stakeholders such as international organisations/NGOs, etc.

### **5.4.1. Raising awareness of local people about environmental protection and cleanliness**

The indicator assesses activities that have been carried out to raise the awareness of the local population about environmental protection and cleanliness and how often these have been performed (publicity campaigns, events, competitions, etc....). It also refers to the tools used to build awareness such as booklets, leaflets, banners and posters, etc....

### **5.4.2. Raising awareness of tourism service providers about environmental protection and cleanliness**

Much as above, the indicator assesses activities that have been carried out to raise the awareness of the tourism service providers about environmental protection and cleanliness and how often these have been performed (publicity campaigns, events, competitions, etc....). It also refers to the tools used to build awareness such as booklets, leaflets, banners and posters, etc....

### **5.4.3. Raising awareness of tourists about environmental protection and cleanliness**

This indicator assesses the level of information provided to tourists on respecting the country's environmental and cleanliness regulations by both public sector agencies and private businesses in contact with tourists.

## **5.5. Green Spaces Indicators**

Green spaces in cities are areas accessible to the general public (the local population as well as tourists) where they can relax. They should be decorated with trees, flowers, and/or grass.

Roundabouts are not considered green areas because their purpose is to filter traffic and not used as areas for the population to relax. Green spaces should also be distinguished from "Natural Tourist Sites", even though natural tourist sites can be linked and surrounded by green space. Furthermore, the cities cannot charge visitors in the green areas a fee to enjoy the area as in the case at some tourist sites.

Green spaces improve living conditions by providing natural locations in the urban areas. In general, some green spaces have already been arranged along the cities. Therefore, the standard is aimed at encouraging the use of green spaces by focusing on their quantity and maintenance.

The standard expectedly desires the cities to implement the green space maintenance and management in a way which is simple, easy and appropriately successful.

### **5.5.1. Quantity of green space in the city**

This assesses the surface area in the city allocated for green spaces.

### **5.5.2. Green space maintenance and management**

This evaluates how often the spaces are maintained, whether there is a regular and set programme to improve the spaces, the quality and maintenance of public furniture (lighting, benches, walkways, etc....) and the environmental management systems that are in place (energy saving system for lighting, irrigation, the use of organic fertiliser, etc....).

## **5.6. Health Safety and Urban Safety and Security Indicators**

"Safety" is a crucial component of a tourism policy. The safety can be classified into non-risk or low risk situations. "Safety" must be considered as a basic human right.

Safety and security is the responsibility of the local authority of the area and ensuring of safety of tourists as well as of people living in the region is the main objective of this indicator. The indicator is aimed at desiring a view of harmonization between international tourists and local people, and at encouraging the cities to take actions to contribute to the reduction of risk which is occurred in all forms and in the sense of contributing to the tourism development in the context of safe tourism.

The indicator assesses the number and quality of health centres, pharmacies and health service providers, that are available in the city as well as evaluating the risk management strategy in place, the extent of sanitation inspection, public order management, the safety of travelling around the city, and the dissemination of information provided to tourists and the local population about the crime prevention and the enforcement of the rules.

#### **5.6.1. Health safety**

This has at least two aspects: 1) evaluation of the number and quality of health centres (hospitals, clinics...) and pharmacies as well as the health service providers; and 2) the extent of sanitation inspection at areas where tourists congregate (restaurants, markets, fast food outlets, street vendors, etc....) according to laws and regulations in place in the country.

#### **5.6.2. Safety and security in the city**

This indicator assesses the level of public order in place and can be measured by the number of police (especially tourist police) and how they are trained to deal with issues involving tourists. How taxi drivers treat tourists courteously and honestly should also be considered.

Another sub-indicator could refer to safety of travelling around the city (traffic, road congestion, safety in crossing roads, safe pavements etc....).

#### **5.6.3. Crime prevention and enforcement of rules (child prostitution, drugs etc.)**

This ascertains the efforts in place to protect the local population from illegal activities and to dissuade tourists from indulging in them such as child prostitution, drugs, trafficking, smuggling, damage of environmental and cultural assets etc.... It evaluates the enforcements of the rules (policing and sanctions) and the effectiveness of awareness campaigns.

#### **5.6.4. Risk management strategy**

This indicator assesses the ability of the country to cope up with unexpected events such as natural disaster etc. It evaluates the scope and effectiveness of risk management strategy if it exists.



## **5.7. Tourism Infrastructure and Facilities Indicators**

The tourism infrastructure and facilities are the principle components of tourism development policies. Tourism development relies on the infrastructure, connectivity, and the abundance of facilities. It is certain that the abundance of infrastructures and facilities would facilitate the travel and transport that are crucially important for tourism. If something to be mentioned below is lack or interruptive by any reason, it will result in obstruction of the urban development as well as the growth of urban tourism. The most important thing is that cities shall have a proper planning for tourism by indicating plans and strategies to control the rhythm of tourism development in the city. Supporting infrastructures are mainly information centres, signage to tourist sites and tourist maps that are crucial for tourism information provision in the city. Other places where tourists as well as local residents can enjoy, together with equipment for serving the different objectives such as relaxation, culture, study, shopping, sports...etc., shall be recommended in the city.

Tourist satisfaction is included in this indicator as cities must be aware of what needs to be improved in order to attract tourists and encourage them to stay longer in the city.

### **5.7.1. Planning for tourism**

This looks whether official plans and strategies are in place to control the development of tourism in the city such as zoning and land use plans for tourism areas, planned tourist itineraries, planning for tourist transportation, a cultural and heritage protection plan etc....

### **5.7.2. Information centres, signage and tourist maps**

This assesses the methods and effectiveness of tourism information provision in the city such as the size and location of information centres and the quality of material available within these centres, signage to tourist sites around the city and whether tourist maps exist, their content and distribution at points of interest in the city.

### **5.7.3. Location of shopping centres and retail outlets**

This evaluates the areas where tourists can find items of interests, whether they are near tourist sites and the city centre, their ease of access and the quality and prices of local crafts and souvenirs.

#### 5.7.4. Leisure areas (tourist areas, public parks, sports and recreation...)

This indicator serves both to assess the range of activities available to tourists and whether these are also available and affordable to local residents.

#### 5.7.5. Level of tourist satisfaction

It is important to monitor how much tourists are enjoying the city (cleanliness, welcome and hospitality, security, appreciation of decor and the environment etc....) and to identify where improvements can be made. Regular surveys are crucial to gauge this information and these need to be analysed. The indicator evaluates whether these surveys are carried out, how often and if actions are formulated to improve the city based on the information contained in the surveys.

## 6. ASEAN Clean Tourist City Standard—CRITERIA

6.1. Table of assessment on 5 indicators of environmental management

ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT		Criteria	Appraisal	Score
1	Urban planning	Is there an urban land use master plan for the city?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Is it being complied with?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Has the city been clearly zoned following a zoning plan?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Is there a transport plan for the city?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are environmental aspects included in the plan?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are these environmental aspects respected?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
2	Environmental regulations	Do environmental regulations controlling the operation of tourism businesses exist?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are these enforced in the city?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>

<b>3</b>	<b>Pollution</b>	Have water quality norms been set by the authorities?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are these enforced in the city?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Is water quality in the city within set norms?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Have air quality norms been set by the authorities in the city?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are these enforced in the city?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Have air quality and water quality been publicly announced?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Have measures been introduced by the authorities to mitigate air pollution (i.e. traffic jam reduction initiatives, catalytic converters, use of fuel...)?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are these enforced in the city?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Have measures been introduced by the authorities to control noise pollution?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are these enforced in the city?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
<b>4</b>	<b>Environmentally friendly transport</b>	Is there any public transport system in the city?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Have the authorities introduced environmentally-friendly public transport (i.e. with pollution controlling mechanisms)?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Have the authorities imposed regulations to control pollution from traffic (i.e. banning vehicles that produce too many emissions; imposing a congestion charge in the city, etc.)?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are these enforced in the city?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		What proportion of environmentally friendly vehicles and non-motorised	_____ % (At least 30%	

		vehicles does the public use compared to total number of vehicles?	of total number to get a score)	
		Have the authorities encouraged (local) people to use non-motorised transport (cycling and walking)?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
<b>5</b>	<b>Sustainable use of energy</b>	What proportion of hotels in the city use energy saving and efficiency devices (eco light bulbs, on-off switches, the use of key cards, etc.) and renewable energy?	Less than 50% Up to or more than 50% (At least 50% to get a score)	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		What proportion of restaurants in the city use energy saving and efficiency devices (lighting, water heating, kitchen ventilation, heating and cooling, maintenance) and renewable energy?	Less than 50% Up to or more than 50% (At least 50% to get a score)	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are tourist businesses made aware of energy-saving techniques that they can use through awareness campaigns?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are there any incentive measures for sustainable use of energy?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
- <b>Number of Detailed Indicators: 5</b> - <b>Number of Criteria: 28</b>			<b>Total</b>	<b>28</b>

## 6.2. Table of assessment on 4 indicators of cleanliness

<b>CLEANLINESS</b>		<b>Criteria</b>	<b>Appraisal</b>	<b>Score</b>
<b>1</b>	Cleanliness of public area	How often do the city authorities clean public areas?	Once a day or more often (At least once a day to get a score)  Less than once a day	<input type="checkbox"/>  <input type="checkbox"/>
		Is public furniture (public benches, lighting, bus shelters, etc.) maintained and regularly cleaned?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are there sufficient public dustbins in public areas?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>

		Are these regularly emptied?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are public buildings properly signposted?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
2	Cleanliness of public toilets	Are public toilets regularly cleaned and maintained? (Link this to <b>ASEAN Public Toilets Standard</b> )	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		How often are they cleaned?	Two times a day or more often (At least 2 times per day to get a score)  Less than two times a day	<input type="checkbox"/>  <input type="checkbox"/>
		Is there a proper separation between toilets for men, women and vulnerable persons?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are public toilets properly signposted?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
3	Cleanliness of tourist sites	Are tourist areas given particular attention in terms of regular cleaning?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		How often are they cleaned?	Two times a day or more often (At least 2 times per day to get a score)  Less than two times a day	<input type="checkbox"/>  <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are there sufficient dustbins at tourist sites?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are there sufficient toilets at tourist sites?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are tourist sites properly signposted?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
4	Cleanliness along the main roads	How often are areas around public roads in the city cleaned by the authorities?	Two times a day or more often (At least 2 times per day to get a score)  Less than two times a day	<input type="checkbox"/>  <input type="checkbox"/>

		Is the equipment used appropriate (i.e., rubbish bins at regular interval, etc.)?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
	- <b>Number of Detailed Indicators: 4</b>		<b>Total</b>	<b>16</b>
	- <b>Number of Criteria: 16</b>			

### 6.3. Table of assessment on 5 indicators of waste management

WASTE MANAGEMENT		Criteria	Appraisal	Score
1	<b>Liquid waste collection</b>	Is there a liquid waste collection system in the city?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Is there any norm related to liquid waste collection?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Is there any measures enforced to punish the violation of this norm?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		What percentage of the city population is connected to the main drainage?	_____% (At least 70% of total to get a score)	
		What percentage of tourism facilities is connected to the main drainage?	_____% (At least 70% to get a score)	
		Is there any complementary method used to dispose of liquid waste?	Collective septic tanks Individual septic tanks Dry well (soakaway) No disposal system (No score)	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
2	<b>Solid waste collection</b>	Does the municipality collect solid waste?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		If no, how is solid waste collected?	Private company Other (i.e. NGO) (specify)	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		How often is solid waste collected?	Once a day or more often (At least once a	<input type="checkbox"/>

			day to get a score) Less than once a day	<input type="checkbox"/>
		What percentage of the city population is connected to the network that disposes of solid waste?	_____ % (At least 70% of total to get a score)	
		What percentage of tourism facilities is connected to the network that disposes of solid waste?	_____ % (At least 70% to get a score)	
3	Liquid waste storage and treatment	Is there a storage area for liquid waste that citizens of the city can use?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are there storage facilities near tourist areas (i.e. septic tanks)?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Is there a treatment plant near the city?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
4	Solid waste storage and treatment	Is there a waste disposal area near the city (i.e. landfill, incineration plant)?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Is there a treatment and recycling plant near the city?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
5	Recycling	Do the city authorities encourage recycling and collect from the population?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Is there any system to collect toxic and polluted waste?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Is there any appropriate equipment for recycling purpose (i.e., tri rubbish bins, etc.)?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are awareness campaigns regularly carried out about recycling aimed at the local population and in particular tourist enterprises?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
- Number of Detailed Indicators: 5 - Number of Criteria: 20			<b>Total</b>	<b>20</b>

#### 6.4. Table of assessment on 3 indicators of Awareness-building about Environmental Protection and Cleanliness Indicators

<b>Awareness-building about Environmental Protection and Cleanliness Indicators</b>		<b>Criteria</b>	<b>Appraisal</b>	<b>Score</b>
<b>1</b>	<b>Raising awareness of local people about environmental protection and cleanliness</b>	Are there any awareness campaigns (publicity, events, competitions, etc.) carried out about environmental protection and cleanliness aimed at the local population?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		How often?	_____times (at least once a year to get a score)	
		Have the authorities produced and disseminated publicity material about environmental protection and cleanliness (booklets, leaflets, banners and posters, etc.)?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
<b>2</b>	<b>Raising awareness of tourist firms about environmental protection and cleanliness</b>	Are there any awareness campaigns (publicity, events, competitions, etc.) carried out about environmental protection and cleanliness aimed at employees of tourist enterprises?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		How often?	_____times (at least once a year to get a score)	
		Are there appropriate materials and activities for the purpose?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
<b>3</b>	<b>Raising awareness of tourists about environmental protection and cleanliness</b>	Are tourists made aware of the city's environmental protection and cleanliness efforts and regulations?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		How often?	_____times (at least once a year to get a score)	
		Are there appropriate materials and activities for the purpose?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <b>Number of Detailed Indicators: 3</b></li> <li>- <b>Number of Criteria: 9</b></li> </ul>			<b>Total</b>	<b>9</b>



### 6.5. Table of assessment on 2 indicators of green spaces

GREEN SPACES		Criteria	Appraisal	Score
1	Quantity of green space in the city	How many parks are there in the city?	_____ (number) (at least one to get a score)	
		What is the proportion of green space compared to total surface area of the city?	_____ % (At least 5% to get a score)	
2	Green space maintenance and management	Which institution maintains and manages green spaces?	Public authorities <input type="checkbox"/> Private company <input type="checkbox"/> Other (i.e. NGO) (specify) <input type="checkbox"/> None (No score) <input type="checkbox"/>	
		Is there a regular scheduled maintenance and management programme?	Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	
		Are there environmental management systems in place (energy saving system for lighting, irrigation, the use of organic fertiliser, etc.)?	Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Number of Detailed Indicators: 2</li> <li>- Number of Criteria: 5</li> </ul>			<b>Total</b>	<b>5</b>

### 6.6. Table of assessment on 4 indicators of health safety and urban safety and security

HEALTH SAFETY AND URBAN SAFETY AND SECURITY		Criteria	Appraisal	Score
1	Health safety	Are there enough health centres in the city?	Yes (At least 1 for 500 inhabitants to get a score)	<input type="checkbox"/>

			No	<input type="checkbox"/>
		Are there enough pharmacies in the city?	Yes (At least 1 for 500 inhabitants to get a score) No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Is there a sanitation norm for the places where tourists congregate (restaurants, markets, fast food outlets, street vendors, etc....)?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		How often are sanitation inspections carried out at areas where tourists congregate (restaurants, markets, fast food outlets, street vendors, etc....)?	Monthly or more often (At least once a month to get a score) Less than once a month	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
2	<b>Safety and security in the city</b>	Are there sufficient police officers in the city? (based on individual country's norm)	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Is there a dedicated tourist police unit in the city?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Have they been properly trained to deal with issues that tourists may have?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
3	<b>Crime prevention and enforcement of rules</b>	Are regulations (protective and preventive measures and activities) against illegal activities resulting from tourism enforced to protect the local population (i.e. child prostitution, drugs, trafficking, smuggling, damage of environmental and cultural assets etc.)?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are awareness campaigns to persuade tourists not to indulge in illegal activities carried out regularly?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
4	<b>Risk management strategy</b>	Is there a risk management system in place?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Is it regularly updated and are the main people involved trained and their skills updated?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>

		Is there a crisis management system in place?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <b>Number of Detailed Indicators: 4</b></li> <li>- <b>Number of Criteria: 12</b></li> </ul>			<b>Total</b>	<b>12</b>

**6.7. Table of assessment on 5 indicators of tourism infrastructure and facilities indicators**

<b>TOURISM INFRASTRUCTURE AND FACILITIES INDICATORS</b>		<b>Criteria</b>	<b>Appraisal</b>	<b>Score</b>
<b>1</b>	<b>Planning for tourism</b>	Has a tourism master plan for the city been formulated?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Is it being implemented?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Is it monitored and adapted on a regular basis (at least every 2 years)?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
<b>2</b>	<b>Information centres, signage and tourist maps</b>	Are there sufficient tourist information centres or points in the city?	Yes (At least one at each main tourist site to get a score) No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are the tourist attractions of the city properly signposted?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are signposts also in English?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Is there a tourist map for the city?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are the map and other tourist information well disseminated at places where tourists congregate in the city?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
<b>3</b>	<b>Location of shopping centres and retail outlets</b>	Are shopping centres and shopping outlets within a reasonable distance of areas where tourists congregate (i.e. attractions, hotels, etc.)?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are there handicraft centres near tourist area?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>

		Are the handicrafts on sale of good quality and representative of the city?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are local products available on sale?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
<b>4</b>	<b>Leisure areas (tourist areas, public parks, sports and recreation, etc.)</b>	Are leisure areas in the city clearly indicated and available to tourists?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Are these affordable to local residents?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
<b>5</b>	<b>Level of tourist satisfaction</b>	Are surveys regularly carried out to gauge tourist satisfaction with the cleanliness, welcome and hospitality, security, and the appreciation of decor and the environment of the city?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		What percentage of tourists is satisfied?	_____ % (At least 70% to get a score)	
		How often are they carried out?	Once a year or more often (At least annually to get a score) Less than once a year	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
		Have the results of the surveys led to actions to improve the situation?	Yes No	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <b>Number of Detailed Indicators: 5</b></li> <li>- <b>Number of Criteria: 18</b></li> </ul>			<b>Total</b>	<b>18</b>

## 7. ASEAN Clean Tourist City Standard—LABEL

### 7.1. Label



**ASEAN Clean Tourist City Standard**

### Connotation of ASEAN Tourism Standard Logo

1. Flower resembling to a lotus means
  - a legendary plant, inducing luxurious enjoyment, peace and beauty
  - a recognition of award and standardization of ASEAN Tourism Services
2. Petals enfolding ASEAN logo signify resilience of Member Countries
3. Different shades of green colour mean protection of environment, fertility, growth, increase of production in tourism industry.

### 7.2. Awards

- ASEAN Cities that get at least 60% of total scores will be awarded the *ASEAN Clean Tourist City Label*.
- The award-winning cities shall receive the certificate of appreciation and plaque imprinting with the *ASEAN Clean Tourist City Label* with 3 year validity.

### 7.3. Certification Process

The certification process will use the following mechanism:

- (a) The certification to be carried out by **one (1) national certification body/committee** appointed by respective NTOs;
- (b) **Self-assessment** would be carried out by applicants;
- (c) National certification body/committee to conduct **site visit** and develop **audit report**;
- (d) Once the city fulfills the criteria and requirement of the Standard, respective **NTOs would update QTWG**;
- (e) The certificate validity: **three (3) years**; and
- (f) Nominations should be made by Member States on a **voluntary basis**, and there would be no limit on number of cities to be awarded. There would be **no category of city**.